

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

In re Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001

03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)  
ECF Case

This document relates to:

*Ashton et al. v. al Qaeda Islamic Army, et al.*, 02-cv-6977 (GBD)(SN)

JAMES P. KREINDLER, Esq., hereby states under penalty of perjury that:

1. I am an attorney representing the *Ashton* plaintiffs in the above-captioned litigation and I submit this declaration in support of the motion for final judgment on behalf of the individual claimants listed in Exhibit A, attached hereto, and for permission to allow any remaining *Ashton* plaintiffs to move for the same relief in separate stages.

2. The source of my information and the basis for my belief in my statements is my personal involvement in this matter for over 17 years; my firm's representation of the claimants listed in Exhibit A in connection with the September 11<sup>th</sup> litigation as well as their family members; communications directly from family members of the individuals killed in the attacks on September 11<sup>th</sup> and the claimants listed in Exhibit A; official records provided by claimants; and other court records relating to the multi-district litigation to which the *Ashton* plaintiffs are or were parties. Any matters about which I lack personal knowledge are asserted herein upon information and belief.

3. I have been retained individually by the claimants listed in Exhibit A to pursue recovery for their solatium losses arising out of the deaths of their loved ones on September 11, 2001. My office has verified that none of the claimants listed in Exhibit A have recovered for their solatium damages previously, nor do they have any other pending motion before this Court for compensation arising out of the September 11<sup>th</sup> attacks.

4. The decedents listed in Exhibit A died in the September 11<sup>th</sup> terrorist attacks and are survived by the non-immediate family members whose relationships to the decedents are described in Exhibit A; the relationships of the non-immediate family members with the persons murdered in the September 11<sup>th</sup> terrorist attacks are detailed with particularity in the accompanying declarations, attached hereto as Exhibit B. These relationships have been personally verified by attorneys and paralegals in my office who have obtained written documentation and/or conducted interviews confirming the nature of the relationships.

5. In support of their entitlement to solatium damages, the non-immediate family member claimants have produced statements detailing the nature of their relationships with their respective decedents in the following declarations, attached hereto as Exhibit B:

B-1. Declaration of Justin Sivin, stepson of Joel Miller.

B-2. Declaration of Maxwell Sivin, stepson of Joel Miller.

B-3. Declaration of Donald Scauso, stepson of Dennis Scauso.

6. The non-immediate family member relationships described in Exhibit A and detailed in Exhibit B satisfy the framework established by this Court and sufficiently show that those claimants are eligible for solatium damages.

7. Accordingly, I respectfully request that this Court grant the proposed Order filed herewith.

Dated: January 3, 2020  
New York, NY

/s/ James P. Kreindler

James P. Kreindler (7084)  
Kreindler & Kreindler LLP  
750 Third Ave, 32<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 687 – 8181